

**Addendum 01 to the
Historic Resources Technical Report
Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project**

June 7, 2010

Prepared for:
City and County of Honolulu

Summary

This addendum supplements materials in the *Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project Historic Resources Technical Report* (RTD 2008a), dated August 15, 2008, and includes additional assessments and information resulting from consultation through May 2010. Unless stated otherwise in this addendum, the historic context and methodology in the Historic Resources Technical Report also apply to this addendum. In any case where this addendum differs from the technical report, the information in this addendum supersedes that of the technical report. Please see the Project's Final Environmental Impact Statement (RTD 2010) for detailed project information and changes since the Draft Environmental Impact Statement (RTD 2008b).

This addendum summarizes consultation with the Hawai'i State Historic Preservation Division (SHPD) that took place in the fall of 2008 regarding revised determinations of National Register of Historic Places (NRHP) eligibility for historic resources, as described in the Historic Resources Technical Report, as well as substantial changes to historic resources that have occurred since distribution of that report in August 2008. This includes the demolition of at least two historic resources. Information contained in this addendum also summarizes the effects determinations for all eligible or listed historic properties and ongoing Section 106 consultation completed to date.

1

Background

| |
|-----------|
| No change |
|-----------|

2

Regulations and Coordination on Historic Resources

| | |
|------------|--|
| Add | The following information is added at the end of Section 2.2—Coordination to Date |
|------------|--|

2.3 Identification of Historic Resources and Consultation with the Hawai'i State Historic Preservation Division

Based on consultation with SHPD between August and November 2008, eight recommendations regarding NRHP eligibility for certain properties as documented in the Historic Resources Technical Report (RTD 2008a) have been revised. This includes the addition of six new NRHP-eligible historic resources and the non-project-related demolition of two previously inventoried NRHP-eligible historic resources.

This addendum summarizes consultation with SHPD regarding the determination of NRHP-eligibility for historic resources as described in the Historic Resources Technical Report (RTD 2008a) and other changes to historic resources in the Project's area of potential effects (APE) that have occurred since distribution of that report in August 2008.

The Historic Resources Technical Report (RTD 2008a) was submitted for review by the SHPD in August 2008. SHPD initially responded with general comments via a letter dated September 26, 2008. SHPD provided additional comments, including specific comments regarding select properties identified within the Project's APE, via a letter dated October 3, 2008, and via an email dated November 14, 2008.

Additional Historic Resources

In the letter dated October 3, 2008, SHPD generally concurred with the findings of the technical report but identified eight properties for additional consideration for NRHP eligibility. As described in this correspondence, these properties are as follows:

1. Ishira House, 94-526 Farrington Highway
2. Terahira Apartments, 94-143 Pupukahi Street
3. Carvalho Apartments, 94-1031 Kahuamoku Street
4. Ohara Apartments, 94-965 Awane Street
5. Sandobal House, 94-1066 Awaiki Place
6. Watercress of Hawai'i, 96-121 Waiawa Road
7. Solmirin House, 96-135 Kamehameha Highway
8. Ala Moana Building, 1441 Kapi'olani Boulevard

In the October letter, SHPD recommended that these eight properties "be considered potentially eligible as good examples of representative local building typologies, rural landscape, vernacular structure, and pre-stress engineering accomplishment, respectively."

Following additional consultation with SHPD in November 2008, six of the eight properties identified above were determined NRHP-eligible, with the exceptions being the Sandobal House and the Solmirin House. As noted in an email dated November 14, 2008, SHPD determined that the Sandobal House had been "compromised by a recent addition" and that the Solmirin House and related residences were deemed to lack "sufficient integrity."

After these discussions, revised survey forms for the additional six NRHP-eligible properties were prepared and delivered to SHPD in November 2008. Copies of the revised survey forms are attached to this addendum in Appendix C.

Revised Names for Historic Resources

Additional research for these properties resulted in new information being discovered regarding the names of three of the six historic resources. This resulted in the following revisions:

- Ishira House was changed to “Tanaka-Ishihara House”
- Terahira Apartments was changed to “Lum-Terahira Three-story Apartments”
- Carvalho Apartments was changed to “Codera-Carvalho Two-story Apartments/Waipahu Hale”

Historic Resource Boundary Change

The proposed boundary for the Ohara Apartments was changed and expanded to include an adjacent apartment building, the Okahara Apartments. Nearly identical to the Ohara Apartments, the Okahara Apartments was most likely built simultaneously and was determined to be an NRHP-eligible resource as well. The boundaries for both apartment buildings were combined and the adjacent free-standing apartments were evaluated as a single historic resource on the same survey form and renamed the “Ohara & Okahara Two-Story Apartments.”

National Register Justifications

The section below discusses the reasons these resources were determined to be eligible for listing in the NRHP.

- The Lum-Terahira Three-story Apartments was determined to be NRHP-eligible under Criterion C because it “embodies the distinctive characteristics of a 1960s period walk-up apartment building.”
- The Tanaka-Ishihara House was determined to be NRHP-eligible under Criterion C because it “embodies the distinctive characteristics of post-World War II, single-wall, vernacular houses.”
- The Ohara & Okahara Two-story Apartments were determined to be NRHP-eligible under Criterion C because the buildings “embody the distinctive characteristics of early post-World War II vernacular apartment buildings.”
- The Codera-Carvalho Two-story Apartments/ Waipahu Hale was determined to be NRHP-eligible under Criterion C because it “embodies the distinctive characteristics of a post-World War II walk-up apartment building.”
- Watercress of Hawai‘i was determined to be NRHP-eligible under Criterion A as a “rural historic landscape district... significant for its association with the history of wetland agriculture in the Waiawa area.”
- The Ala Moana Building was determined to be NRHP-eligible under Criterion C because it “illustrates the developing technology of pre-stressed concrete in the construction of large buildings in the early 1960s...when Hawai‘i was a national leader in the use of pre-stressed concrete” and as an

example of the work of master architect John Graham, Jr. (1909-1991), of Seattle, Washington.

SHPD concurred with the updated materials and determinations of NRHP-eligibility via an email dated November 14, 2008. All referenced correspondence is attached to this addendum in Appendix D.

Additional NRHP Eligibility Determinations

At the request of the Federal Transit Administration (FTA), a refinement of the Airport Alternative was studied in late 2009 and early 2010. As part of the environmental evaluation of this design option, PB identified fifteen additional resources built before 1965 and evaluated these resources for NRHP eligibility. These buildings consisted of warehouses and light industrial properties surrounding the airport. Each resource was photographed and documented using the SHPD-approved form entitled "Surveyed Property Considered Not Eligible for National Register of Historic Places" since none of the resources were eligible for listing in the NRHP. These fifteen forms were submitted to the SHPD on April 28, 2010; the SHPD concurred with these not eligible determinations in a letter dated May 27, 2010. Because there are no additional eligible historic properties, the SHPD also concurred that there would be no additional historic properties affected by the proposed change in alignment. This correspondence is attached to this addendum as Appendix D.

Historic Resources Demolished

Two historic properties in the Project's APE that had been inventoried and previously determined NRHP-eligible by SHPD have been demolished since the technical report was published in August 2008. These demolitions, which were not related to the Project, are as follows:

- Tsumoto Shophouse, a commercial building constructed in 1947 and located at 1350 Dillingham Boulevard; demolished in November 2008
- AC Electric, a two-story commercial building constructed in 1943 and located at 1354 Dillingham Boulevard; demolished in November 2008

These two properties are no longer extant and, therefore, cannot be considered to be potentially NRHP-eligible. No additional documentation of these properties is required under Section 106.

Revised List of NRHP-eligible Historic Resources

Based on consultation with SHPD in the fall of 2008, the addition of six new historic properties and the recent demolition of two historic properties resulted in the Project APE now containing 81 historic resources that are either listed in the NRHP or have been determined to be eligible for listing in the NRHP.

Table A1-1 lists these 81 historic resources, categorized by their location along the project corridor. These properties were further evaluated for effects per 36 CFR 800.5 in the *Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project Historic Effects Report* (RTD 2009), dated April 14, 2009.

Table A1-1: Identified NRHP-listed and NRHP-eligible Historic Properties by Station Sectors

| Property Name | TMK Parcel No. | Property Type | NRHP Status | Criteria |
|--|--------------------|---------------------|-------------|----------|
| Station Sectors 6 through 8: East Kapolei, UH West O'ahu, and Ho'opili from Kalo'i Gulch to Fort Weaver Road/Kunia Road | | | | |
| Honouliuli Stream Bridge | N/A | Bridge | Eligible | A & C |
| Station Sector 9: West Loch from Fort Weaver Road /Kunia Road to Waikele Stream | | | | |
| Lum-Terahira Three-story Apartments | 94039082 | Apartment building | Eligible | C |
| West O'ahu Christian Church/ former American Security Bank (round plan) | 94027127 | Former commercial | Eligible | C |
| Tanaka-Ishihara House | 94025008 | House | Eligible | C |
| Station Sector 10: Waipahu Transit Center from Waikele Stream to Waipi'o Point Access Road /Kahualii Street | | | | |
| Waikele Stream Bridge, eastbound span and bridge over OR&L spur | N/A | Bridge pair | Eligible | A & C |
| Ohara & Okahara Two-story Apartments | 94019021, 94019020 | Apartment buildings | Eligible | C |
| Codera-Carvalho Two-story Apartments/Waipahu Hale | 94017043 | Apartment building | Eligible | C |
| Waipahu Hawai'i Stake, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints | 94036071 | Church building | Eligible | A |
| Station Sector 11: Leeward Community College from Waipi'o Point Access Road/Kahualii Street to the H-1 Freeway (at Farrington Highway overpass) | | | | |
| Watercress of Hawai'i | 96003026 | Farm | Eligible | A |
| Station Sector 12: Pearl Highlands from the H-1 Freeway (at Farrington Highway overpass) to 'Ewa side of Hawaiian Electric Company (HECO) Waiau | | | | |
| Waiawa Stream Bridge 1932 (westbound lanes) | N/A | Bridge | Eligible | A & C |
| Waiawa Separation Bridge | N/A | Bridge | Eligible | A & C |
| Waiawa Stream Bridge 1952 (eastbound lanes) | N/A | Bridge | Eligible | A & C |
| Waiawa Booster Pump Station | 96003045 | Pump station | Eligible | A & C |
| Station Sector 13: Pearlridge from 'Ewa side of HECO Waiau to 'Ewa side of Aiea Cemetery | | | | |
| HECO Waiau Plant | 98003010, 98004003 | Power plant | Eligible | A |
| Nishi Service | 98006024 | Commercial | Eligible | C |
| Waimalu Stream Bridge | N/A | Bridge | Eligible | A |
| Waimalu Shopping Center | 98022074, 98022081 | Commercial | Eligible | A & C |

Table A1-1: Identified NRHP-listed and NRHP-eligible Historic Properties by Station Sectors (continued)

| Property Name | TMK Parcel No. | Property Type | NRHP Status | Criteria |
|--|-----------------------|---------------------------|-------------|----------|
| Sumida Watercress Farm | 98016046, 98016047 | Farm | Eligible | A & C |
| Kalauao Spring Bridge | N/A | Bridge | Eligible | A |
| Kalauao Stream Bridge | N/A | Bridge | Eligible | A |
| Forty Niner Saimin | 98018042 | Commercial | Eligible | A & C |
| Akiona House (Quonset) | 98018041 | House | Eligible | C |
| Station Sector 14: Aloha Stadium from 'Ewa side of 'Aiea Cemetery to road to CINCPAC Landing | | | | |
| 'Aiea Cemetery/Honolulu Plantation Cemetery | 99012006, 99012001 | Cemetery | Eligible | A & D |
| Station Sector 35: Richardson Recreation Center from road to CINCPAC Landing to Arizona Street/Hālawā Drive Intersection with Kamehameha Highway | | | | |
| United States Naval Base, Pearl Harbor National Historic Landmark | Various | Historic district | NHL | |
| Bombproof Switch Station—Facility B-6 | 99003038 | Military utility building | Eligible | A & C |
| Richardson Recreation Center Pool Complex (Swimming Pool—Facility S-21; Recreation Facility—Facility 1; Bath House/Locker Room—Facility 2; Handball Court—Facility S-20) | 99003029 | Recreation center | Eligible | A |
| Kamehameha Highway Bridge over Hālawā Stream (mauka span) | N/A | Bridge | Eligible | A |
| Commander-in-Chief Pacific Fleet (CINCPACFLT) Headquarters—Facility 250 National Historic Landmark | 99002004 | Military office building | NHL | |
| Fuel Oil Pump-out Pump House—Facility S-386 | 99001001 | Pump station | Eligible | C |
| Station Sector 36: Pearl Harbor Naval Base from Arizona Street/Hālawā Drive to Valkenburgh Street | | | | |
| Publications Printing Office and Plant—Facility 550/District Printing Plant | 99001008 | Military office building | Eligible | A |
| Potential Makalapa Navy Housing Historic District | 99002004 | Historic district | Eligible | A & C |
| Navy Upper Tank Farm (fuel storage) | 99001008 | Fuel storage tanks | Eligible | A |
| Ossipoff's Aloha Chapel, SMART Clinic, and Navy-Marine Corps Relief Society—Facility 1514 | 99001008 | Military office building | Eligible | C |
| Potential Little Makalapa Navy Housing Historic District | 99002004 | Historic district | Eligible | A & C |
| Navy WWII splinterproof shelter—Facility S-51 | 99001008 | Bomb shelter | Eligible | A & C |

Table A1-1: Identified NRHP-listed and NRHP-eligible Historic Properties by Station Sectors (continued)

| Property Name | TMK Parcel No. | Property Type | NRHP Status | Criteria |
|---|--------------------|----------------------|-------------|-----------|
| Rehab Center/former Navy Fire Station—Facility 199 | 99001008 | Former fire station | Eligible | A & C |
| Station Sector 38: Lagoon Drive from Paiea Street to Middle Street | | | | |
| Hawai'i Employers Council | 11016004 | Office building | Eligible | A & C |
| Station Sector 19: Middle Street from Middle Street to Laumaka Street/Ewa side of OCCC | | | | |
| Gaspro Store | 12013007 | Commercial | Eligible | C |
| Foremost Dairy | 12013006 | Dairy complex | Eligible | A & C |
| Station Sector 20: Kalihi from Laumaka Street/Ewa side of OCCC to Waiakamilo Road | | | | |
| Lava Rock Curbs | N/A | Roadway curbing | Eligible | A & C |
| Pu'uhale Market | 12012014 | Commercial | Eligible | A |
| Afuso House | 12009017 | House | Eligible | A & C |
| Higa Four-Plex | 12009017 | House | Eligible | A & C |
| Teixeira House | 12009018 | House | Eligible | A & C |
| Pang Craftsman-style House | 12009060 | House | Eligible | A & C |
| 10 Courtyard Houses | 12002113 | Multiple houses | Eligible | A & C |
| Duarte House | 12002108 | House | Eligible | A & C |
| Boulevard Saimin | 15029060 | Commercial | Eligible | A |
| Station Sector 21: Kapālama from Waiakamilo Road to Akepo Lane | | | | |
| True Kamani Trees | N/A | Street tree planting | Eligible | A & C |
| Kapālama Canal Bridge | N/A | Bridge | Eligible | A & C |
| Six Quonset Huts | 15015008 | Quonset buildings | Eligible | A & C |
| Station Sector 22: Iwilei from Akepo Lane to Iwilei Road | | | | |
| Institute for Human Services/ Tamura Building | 15007033 | Office building | Eligible | C |
| Tong Fat Co. | 15007003 | Commercial | Eligible | A & C |
| Wood Tenement Buildings behind Tong Fat Co. | 15007003 | Multiple houses | Eligible | A & C |
| O'ahu Railway & Land Co. Terminal Building | 15007001, 15007002 | Railway terminal | Eligible | A & C |
| O'ahu Railway & Land Co. Office/ Document Storage Building | 15007001, 15007002 | Office building | Eligible | A & C |
| Former filling station on OR&L property | 15007001 | Commercial | Eligible | A |
| O'ahu Railway & Land Co. basalt paving blocks | 15007001, 15007002 | Street pavers | Eligible | A, C, & D |
| Station Sector 23: Chinatown from Iwilei Road to Queen Street | | | | |
| Nu'uānu Stream Bridge | N/A | Bridge | Eligible | A & C |
| Chinatown Historic District | Various | Historic district | Listed | |
| Harbor retaining wall of coral blocks from Honolulu Fort | 21001056 | Harbor wall | Eligible | D |

Table A1-1: Identified NRHP-listed and NRHP-eligible Historic Properties by Station Sectors (continued)

| Property Name | TMK Parcel No. | Property Type | NRHP Status | Criteria |
|---|--------------------|-------------------|-------------|-----------|
| Merchant Street Historic District (including Walter Murray Gibson Building/Honolulu Police Station) | 21002024, 21002057 | Office building | Listed | |
| Station Sector 24: Downtown from Queen Street to Punchbowl Street | | | | |
| DOT Harbors Division | 21001005 | Office building | Eligible | A |
| Pier 10/11 | 21001001 | Maritime terminal | Eligible | A & C |
| Walker Park | N/A | Park | Eligible | A & C |
| Irwin Memorial Park | 21013007 | Park | Eligible | A, B, & C |
| Aloha Tower | 21001013 | Tower | Listed | |
| Dillingham Transportation Building | 21014003 | Office building | Listed | |
| HECO Downtown Plant and Leslie A. Hicks Building | 21014006 | Power plant | Eligible | A |
| Hawai'i Capital Historic District (including Attorney General's Office/Hale 'Auhau) | 21026022 | Office building | Listed | |
| Station Sector 25: Civic Center from Punchbowl Street to Cooke Street | | | | |
| Department of Transportation | 21031012 | Office building | Eligible | C |
| Royal Brewery/The Honolulu Brewing & Malting Co. | 21031021 | Industrial | Listed | |
| [Old] Kaka'ako Fire Station | 21031018 | Fire station | Listed | |
| Kamaka Ukulele | 21030014 | Industrial | Eligible | A |
| Mother Waldron Neighborhood Playground | 21051005, 21051006 | Park | Eligible | A & C |
| Station Sector 26: Kaka'ako from Cooke Street to Waimanu Street | | | | |
| Fuji Sake Brewing Co. | 21052008 | Industrial | Eligible | C |
| Ching Market and House | 21050049 | Commercial | Eligible | A & C |
| American Savings Bank/Liberty Bank—Queen-Ward Branch | 21050052 | Commercial | Eligible | C |
| Station Sector 27: Ala Moana Center from Waimanu Street to Mahukona Street | | | | |
| Pacific Development Office Building | 23007029 | Office building | Eligible | C |
| Hawaiian Life Building | 23039023 | Office building | Eligible | C |
| Ala Moana Building | 23039001 | Office building | Eligible | C |

| |
|-----------|
| No change |
|-----------|

As discussed in Section 2, the FTA also refined the Airport Alignment to transition from Aolele Street to Ualena Street to avoid the central portion of the Runway Protection Zone (RPZ), which required that fifteen additional resources built prior to 1965 be evaluated for NRHP eligibility. None of these resources were determined eligible; the SHPD concurred with these determinations on May 27, 2010.

Since the preliminary assessment of effects presented in the Historic Resources Technical Report, a thorough assessment of effects for all eligible resources was completed in April 2009. Adverse effects to 22 historic properties were identified. In subsequent correspondence during the summer of 2009, the SHPD identified 11 additional resources that it believed were adversely affected. In the interest of the project schedule, FTA agreed to accept these additional determinations of adverse effect. This correspondence is included as Appendix D to this addendum. Therefore, 33 resources were determined to be adversely affected by the proposed project. These resources include:

- Honouliuli Stream Bridge
- Waikele Stream Bridge and Span over OR&L Spur
- 1932 Waiawa Stream Bridge
- Waimalu Stream Bridge
- Kalauao Springs Bridge
- Kalauao Stream Bridge
- United States Naval Base, Pearl Harbor National Historic Landmark
- CINCPAC Headquarters Building National Historic Landmark
- Makalapa Navy Housing Historic District
- Ossipoff's Aloha Chapel, SMART Clinic, and Navy-Marine Corps Relief Society
- Hawai'i Employers Council
- Afuso House
- Higa Four-plex
- Teixeira House

- Lava Rock Curbs
- Six Quonset Huts
- Kapālama Canal Bridge
- True Kamani Trees
- Institute for Human Services/Tamura Building
- Wood Tenement Buildings
- O'ahu Rail & Land Co. Office and Document Storage Building
- O'ahu Rail & Land Co. Terminal Building
- Nu'uuanu Stream Bridge
- Chinatown Historic District
- Merchant Street Historic District
- HDOT Harbors Division Offices
- Pier 10/11 Building
- Aloha Tower
- Irwin Park
- Walker Park
- HECO Downtown Plant
- Dillingham Transportation Building
- Mother Waldron Playground

6

Mitigation

Acknowledging that the Project would have adverse effects on historic resources, the City began informally discussing general, potential mitigation measures with consulting parties as part of other project-related meetings as early as 2008. The City initiated formal consultation with 32 consulting parties in July 2009 to develop a Programmatic Agreement (PA) to address adverse effects to built historic resources, as well as present a plan for addressing archeological resources. At this time, more than 10 consulting parties meetings have occurred and a draft PA, which offers substantial mitigation measures, continues to be reviewed prior to formal execution by signatories.

References

| | |
|-----------|---|
| RTD 2008 | City and County of Honolulu Department of Transportation Services, Rapid Transit Division. July 2008. <i>Honolulu high-capacity transit corridor project historic resources technical report.</i> |
| RTD 2008b | City and County of Honolulu Department of Transportation Services, Rapid Transit Division. October 2008. <i>Honolulu high-capacity transit corridor project draft environmental impact statement/section 4(f) evaluation.</i> |
| RTD 2009 | City and County of Honolulu Department of Transportation Services, Rapid Transit Division. April 2009. <i>Honolulu high- capacity transit corridor project historic effects report.</i> |
| RTD 2010 | City and County of Honolulu Department of Transportation Services, Rapid Transit Division. June 2010. <i>Honolulu high-capacity transit corridor project final environmental impact statement/section 4(f) evaluation.</i> |

Acronyms

| |
|------------|
| Add |
|------------|

| | |
|----|------------------------|
| PA | Programmatic Agreement |
|----|------------------------|

Appendix C Revised Survey Forms for Additional NRHP-eligible Properties

| | |
|------------|------------------------------------|
| Add | Add new Appendix C in its entirety |
|------------|------------------------------------|

Appendix D Correspondence

| | |
|------------|------------------------------------|
| Add | Add new Appendix D in its entirety |
|------------|------------------------------------|

Appendix C

Revised Survey Forms for Additional NRHP-eligible Properties

HONOLULU HIGH CAPACITY TRANSIT CORRIDOR PROJECT
SURVEYED PROPERTY CONSIDERED ELIGIBLE FOR NATIONAL REGISTER

Historic Status: **Evaluated Eligible**

Resource Name/Historic Name: **Lum-Terahira Three-Story Apartments**

Location: **94-143 Pupukahi Street**

Owner: **Terahira, Takatoshi**

Date-Original: **1965**

Source: **Tax Office**

Present Use/Historic Use: **Residential**

Architectural Description:

This symmetrical, three-story, nine-unit apartment building is constructed of reinforced concrete and concrete masonry units (CMU). It has a flat concrete roof with thin overhanging eaves and thin cantilevered concrete canopies forming walkways and balconies at the second and third stories. Cantilevered concrete walkways run across the façade. Near the front corners outset stair "towers" handle vertical circulation requirements; the cast concrete steps are also cantilevered. The stairs and walkways have simple aluminum railings with thin vertical rails. The building has glass jalousie windows and flush entry doors. Above the doors are solid-panel transoms. The only decorative details are the perforated CMU blocks, one in the rear balcony of each unit.

Significance:

This post-war walk-up apartment building might qualify under Criterion "C" – since it embodies the distinctive characteristics of a 1960s period walk-up apartment building, with its flat roof and minimal decorative detailing. This is a building type that requires further context study.

TMK: **94039082**

Portion of Alignment: **'Ewa Portion**

Sector: **09 West Loch Station Sector**

Station Block:

Integrity:

Pipe post supports added at rear corners of building at first and second floors.



Prepared by Mason Architects

November 2008

HONOLULU HIGH CAPACITY TRANSIT CORRIDOR PROJECT
SURVEYED PROPERTY CONSIDERED ELIGIBLE FOR NATIONAL REGISTER

Historic Status: **Evaluated Eligible**

Resource Name/Historic Name: **Tanaka-Ishihara House**

Location: **94-526 Farrington Hwy**

Owner: **Ishihara, Wallace/ Florence Tr**

Date-Original: **1956**

Source: **Tax Office**

Present Use/Historic Use: **Residential**

Architectural Description:

This one-story vernacular house is single-wall construction of vertical tongue-and-groove (T&G) boards with a single girt at the sill level of the windows. Most of the foundation is wood posts resting on small, square, concrete blocks, screened by horizontal wood slats. The house has a complex hip roof with gablets. The overhanging eaves have exposed rafters and fascia boards. Metal gutters, with half cylinder section, are installed near the front entrance. The windows are mostly wide-blade jalousies, with one large fixed window. The design of the wood railing at the front entry has influences of traditional Asian and modern architecture. In front is a low lava rock wall and a wood-framed, two-car carport with an extremely low-slope roof of corrugated metal. The carport has storage closets along one side. The sloping topography of the parcel, with a stream at the rear, accommodates a small partial basement.

Significance:

Criterion "C" – embodies the distinctive characteristics of post-WWII, single-wall, vernacular houses. Generally, such houses are representative of an evolution in utilitarian housing in Hawaii. Traditional elements in this house, which maintain continuity with designs in the decades prior to WWII, are T&G walls, exterior girt, and wide eaves with exposed rafter tails. More modern features include the horizontality of the design, expressed by the floor plan and low-pitch roof, as well as the picture window, glass jalousies, and entry railing. Further context study of post-WWII vernacular housing is needed.

TMK: **94025008**

Portion of Alignment: **'Ewa Portion**

Sector: **09 West Loch Station Sector**

Station Block:

Integrity:

Roof gablets probably covered with shingles later, since colors do not match roof shingles. New front door installed. Road widening in early 1960s took 40% of lot. The carport [garage] was altered in October 1962 due to new highway right-of-way (C&C Bldg. Permit 205871).



Prepared by Mason Architects

November 2008

HONOLULU HIGH CAPACITY TRANSIT CORRIDOR PROJECT
SURVEYED PROPERTY CONSIDERED ELIGIBLE FOR NATIONAL REGISTER

Historic Status: **Evaluated Eligible**

Resource Name/Historic Name: **Ohara & Okahara Two-Story Apartments**

Location: **94-965 & 94-973 Awane'i Street**

Owner: **Ohara, Kimiko TR Est & Okahara, Frederick M TR**

Date-Original: **1956**

Source: **Tax Office**

Present Use/Historic Use: **Residential**

Architectural Description:

These matching two-story apartment buildings are constructed of brick-like CMU at the first story and at the second story of vertical tongue-and-groove (T&G) siding with a single girt at window-sill level. Each has a low-slope hip roof; the Ohara Apartment roof is covered with ribbed metal panels, while the Okahara building's roof has asphalt shingles. The wide overhanging eaves of both have exposed rafters. Each has two dog-leg concrete stairs, with bases of CMU and with thin metal railings, providing access to their second-floor walkway and apartments. The walkway in each has a solid railing of horizontal boards. Cantilevered concrete canopies project over the first-floor windows on ends and rear walls. In the Ohara building the rear canopy is supported by a wood beam and posts. Windows in both buildings are glass jalousies.

Significance:

Criterion "C" – both embody the distinctive characteristics of early post-WWII vernacular apartment buildings. These two buildings feature simplified construction and detailing. Some elements of the design and materials, such as hip roofs and T&G siding, reflect utilitarian single-wall residences typical of (but not restricted to) Hawaii's pre-WWII period; the CMU walls and the jalousie windows are materials commonly used after WWII. These multi-family buildings, with their minimal ornamentation, reflect their post-war period. However, as noted above, other design features of these apartments show continuity with earlier residential markers. The transitional buildings between Hawaii's pre-WWII vernacular houses and apartment buildings commonly seen in the islands after Statehood need further context study.

TMK: **94019020 & 94019021**

Portion of Alignment: **'Ewa Portion**

Sector: **10 Waipahu Transit Center
Station Sector**

Station Block:

Integrity:

Both appear unaltered, except in the Ohara Apartments the original corrugated metal roofing replaced by ribbed metal panels, and in the Okahara Apartments by asphalt shingles.



Prepared by Mason Architects

November 2008

HONOLULU HIGH CAPACITY TRANSIT CORRIDOR PROJECT
SURVEYED PROPERTY CONSIDERED ELIGIBLE FOR NATIONAL REGISTER

Historic Status: **Evaluated Eligible**

Resource Name/Historic Name: **Codera-Carvalho Two-Story Apartments / Waipahu Hale**

Location: **94-1031 Kahuamoku Street**

Owner: **Carvalho, Charles TR**

Date-Original: **1965**

Source: **Tax Office**

Present Use/Historic Use: **Residential**

Architectural Description:

This two-story, 8-unit apartment building is constructed of reinforced concrete and concrete masonry units (CMU). It has a flat concrete roof with thin overhanging eaves. At the second story, there is a row of concrete balconies on one side and on the other side a concrete walkway, the latter accessed by concrete stairs that run along the ends of the rectangular building. The stairs have thin metal railings. The walkway and balcony each have a railing of CMU with perforated grille sections of blocks arranged in a geometric pattern. The end walls of the building at the balcony / lanai side of the building also have perforated CMU screen, extending from grade to the eaves, in a more grid-like pattern. Windows in the building are glass jalousies.

Significance:

This post-war walk-up apartment building might qualify under Criterion "C" – since it embodies the distinctive characteristics of examples of this period and type of housing. It is also notable for its application of ornamental detailing using two patterns of perforated CMU. Decorative masonry screens were frequently used on this style of building in Hawaii from about the 1950s. Further context study is needed of post-war walk-up apartment buildings. This context study could include an overview of designs with perforated concrete blocks, as well as other trends in apartment layout, material, and ornamentation, noting also social and governmental influences.

TMK: **94017043**

Portion of Alignment: **'Ewa Portion**

Sector: **10 Waipahu Transit Center
Station Sector**

Station Block:

Integrity:

Appears unaltered, except one section of walkway railing appears to have replaced perforated CMU with plain blocks.



Prepared by Mason Architects

November 2008

HONOLULU HIGH CAPACITY TRANSIT CORRIDOR PROJECT
SURVEYED PROPERTY CONSIDERED ELIGIBLE FOR NATIONAL REGISTER

Historic Status: **Evaluated Eligible – as a Rural Historic Landscape District**

Resource Name/Historic Name: **Watercress of Hawaii**

Location: **96-121 Waiawa Road**

Owner: **B P Bishop Estate TR - lease to Watercress of HI**

Date-Original: **unknown**

Source: **Fennel (Dec. 2006) and Tax Office records**

Present Use/Historic Use: **Farm**

Landscape and Architectural Description:

This large property (greater than 35 acres) contains extensive agricultural areas, some partitioned by low walls and natural contours into plots for growing watercress and other crops. The eastern side of the parcel has large rectangular watercress beds, most of them measuring about 40' x 80'. In the western part of the parcel the beds are of various sizes and shapes. The waters of Waiawa Spring and unnamed springs, natural artesian water sources located on the property, are contained and channeled through these beds. Watercress cultivation requires a flowing depth of 3" of high-quality alkaline water. The topography of this parcel also provides the wind protection necessary for this crop. A number of buildings are also located on the property; some are agricultural outbuildings and others residential.

Significance:

Criterion "A" – qualifies as a rural historic landscape district which is significant for its association with the history of wetland agriculture in the Waiawa area. This property exemplifies the historical continuity of occupational activities involved with growing crops in flooded fields, from the cultivation of taro, starting in the pre-contact period, through rice and watercress production in recent centuries. Further context study is needed of such landscapes in Hawaii.

TMK: **96003026**

Portion of Alignment: **'Ewa Portion**

Sector: **11 Leeward Community College Station Sector**

Station Block:

Integrity:

The property retains the historic relationship between the lower agricultural fields and the higher land areas with buildings (along Waiawa Road). The parcel's visual connection with the Pearl Harbor waters of Middle Loch is also intact. Some re-configuration of the fields has occurred, including the construction of rectangular watercress beds in the east portion of the property. The buildings have had numerous undated alterations made to them and do not appear to have sufficient integrity to be considered contributing elements.



Prepared by Mason Architects

November 2008

HONOLULU HIGH CAPACITY TRANSIT CORRIDOR PROJECT
SURVEYED PROPERTY CONSIDERED ELIGIBLE FOR NATIONAL REGISTER

Historic Status: **Evaluated Eligible**

Resource Name/Historic Name: **Ala Moana Building**

Location: **1441 Kapiolani Blvd**

Owner: **GGP Ala Moana LLC**

Date-Original: **1959**

Source: **Tax Office. Birch Storm, "Isle's Tallest Building Goes Up Easily," *Honolulu Advertiser*, July 31, 1960: p. A-19. Chad Randl, *Revolving Architecture*. Princeton Architectural Press, 2008.**

Present Use/Historic Use: **Offices/ Bank on lower floors**

Architectural Description:

This 23-story office building was constructed using prestressed concrete. The building has a glazed storefront at the bottom floor and two parking platforms above that; the lower one is screened from Kapiolani Boulevard by a decorative wall of perforated CMU. The main tower of the building has a smaller rectangular footprint than the large parking platforms. It features fixed sash windows in groups of three with paired, horizontal, fixed-louver sun screen awnings over each triplet. The uppermost part of the building is circular in plan, tapering inward towards the base. The maximum diameter is slightly larger than the width of the main tower. This circular portion is ringed by a band of canted fixed-light windows and has a low-slope conical roof, with a slight overhang at the eaves. Mechanical equipment on the roof is hidden by a metal screen in the shape of an inverted conical section; rising above it is a spire or antenna at the roof's apex.

Significance:

Criterion "C" – illustrates the developing technology of prestressed concrete in the construction of large buildings in the early 1960s, a time when Hawaii was a national leader in the use of prestressed concrete. This building was claimed to be Hawaii's tallest building when it was completed and the world's tallest prestressed concrete building. Originally, the circular top section was the first revolving restaurant in the U.S., although smaller and less famous than the one in the Seattle Space Needle.

Criterion "C" – an example of the work of a master architect, John Graham & Co. He is known as a world-renowned pioneer in the design of large shopping centers and malls from the late 1950s onward. He also designed Ala Moana Center and the Seattle Space Needle.

TMK: **23039001**

Portion of Alignment: **Koko Head Portion**

Sector: **27 Ala Moana Center Station Sector**

Station Block: **Ala Moana Station Block**

Integrity:

The original, 12'-long, vertical sun louvers, which formerly covered the triplet windows with upright lines, have been removed. These louvers were movable, controlled by a mechanism which tracked the sun, then opened and closed the louvers to maintain shade in the building's offices. These louvers were removed ca. 2000 and the horizontal sun screens were installed. The circular top floor was a 120- to 140-seat restaurant, with a revolving floor that turned at one revolution per hour. The restaurant has been converted to office use; it is not known if the revolving floor is still operational.



Prepared by
Mason Architects
November 2008

Appendix D

Correspondence

LINDA LINGLE
GOVERNOR OF HAWAII



STATE OF HAWAII
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES

POST OFFICE BOX 621
HONOLULU, HAWAII 96809

LAURA H. THIELLEN
CHAIRPERSON
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

RUSSELL Y. TSUI
FIRST DEPUTY

KEN C. KAWAHARA
DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT
ENGINEERING
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION
KAOIOLANI ISLAND RESERVES COMMISSION
LAND
STATE PARKS

September 26, 2008

Mr. Wayne Yoshioka, Director
Department of Transportation Services
City and County of Honolulu
650 South King Street, 3rd Floor
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

LOG NO: 2008.3762
DOC NO: 0809AL44
Architecture

Dear Mr. Yoshioka:

SUBJECT: Section 106 (NHPA) Consultation
Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor
Purpose and Need for the Project and Alternatives Chapters, Draft
Environmental Impact Statement
Technical Report: Historic Resources
Island of O'ahu
TMK: (1) (various)

This is in response to your transmittal, dated August 18 and received in our office on August 22, 2008. Thank you for providing the opportunity to comment on the draft Historic Resources Technical Report, dated August 1, as well as confidential, intergovernmental advance portions of the draft Environmental Impact Statement. Our office requested to postpone our response until after our September 19 project update and coordination meeting with staff from Parsons Brinckerhoff, Mason Architects Inc., and other stakeholders. This slight delay enables us to incorporate useful information from that meeting into our response.

The proposed project covers the fundable twenty-mile segment of the corridor between East Kapolei and the Ala Moana Center with alternatives for both Fixed Guideway Transit Alternatives of the Salt Lake and Airport routes. Complete analysis of the historic resources and determination of effect for the University of Hawaii, West Kapolei, and Waikiki spurs have not been fully addressed in the documentation, as those portions of the project are not yet funded and will be subject to additional consultation at a future time. Consultation between the Federal Transit Administration, State Historic Preservation Officer, and other consulting and concurring parties will result in a Memorandum of Agreement regarding the proposed undertaking's impact to architectural resources.

The State Historic Preservation Division (SHPD) has several comments that it would like to offer for consideration at this time:

Table S-1: Summary of Identification, Evaluation, and Effects—Historic Resources (p. S-2) presents the findings of the number of State or National Register of Historic Places listed, known eligible, or evaluated eligible resources, numbering in total 119 if both the Salt Lake and Airport segments are completed. However, the summary only indicates a total of six resources for which the FTA proposes a determination of adverse effect due to demolition. The SHPD does not concur with this preliminary determination that adverse effects for this project are limited to those six resources. The Historic Hawai'i Foundation expressed the same concern in their letter of September 15, specifically regarding

LINDA LINGLE
GOVERNOR OF HAWAII



**STATE OF HAWAII
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES**

POST OFFICE BOX 621
HONOLULU, HAWAII 96809

LAURA H. THIELEN
CHAIRPERSON
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

RUSSELL Y. TSUJI
FIRST DEPUTY

KEN C. KAWAHARA
DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT
ENGINEERING
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION
LAND
STATE PARKS

October 3, 2008

Mr. Wayne Yoshioka, Director
Department of Transportation Services
City and County of Honolulu
650 South King Street, 3rd Floor
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

**LOG NO: 2008.3917
DOC NO: 0810AL02
Architecture**

Dear Mr. Yoshioka:

**SUBJECT: Section 106 (NHPA) Consultation
Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor
Eligibility Determinations
Island of O'ahu
TMK: (1) (various)**

This is in response to your transmittal, dated August 25 and received in our office on September 2, 2008. The submitted determinations of eligibility for structures along the proposed Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor include all properties one tax map lot deep flanking the corridor. Professional architectural historians (Mason Architects Inc.) assessed all resources constructed before 1969, including residential, industrial, commercial, military, and sacred resources as well as historic landscape features. Inventory forms provided photographs, brief architectural descriptions and significance and integrity evaluations. A total of 626 resources were identified and 79 presented as listed on or eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places in accordance with the National Park Service criteria. We appreciate the amount of substantive research that characterizes the submitted documentation.

Determinations pertain to the fundable twenty-mile segment of the corridor between East Kapolei and the Ala Moana Center with alternatives for both Fixed Guideway Transit Alternatives of the Salt Lake and Airport routes. Complete analysis of the historic resources and determination of effect for the University of Hawaii, West Kapolei, and Waikiki spurs have not been fully addressed in the documentation, as those portions of the project are not yet funded and will be subject to additional consultation at a future time.

The State Historic Preservation Division (SHPD) generally concurs with the determinations provided, although we have some concerns regarding the potential eligibility of some additional properties. Following our September 19 meeting with project coordinators, we did have the opportunity to discuss our preliminary review of the eligibility documentation with staff of Mason Architects, who were subsequently extremely helpful in providing additional photographs of specific properties.

At this time and based on those photographs, we would like suggest that the following additional properties be considered potentially eligible as good examples of representative local building typologies, rural landscape, vernacular structure, and pre-stress engineering accomplishment respectively:

Waipahu-Aiea Segment

94-526 Farrington Highway (1956)—Ishira House
94-143 Pupukahi Street (1965)—Terahira Apartments

94-1031 Kahumoku Street (1965)—Carvalho Apartments
94-965 Awane Street (1956)—Ohara Apartments
94-1066 Awaiki Place (1959)—Sandobal House
96-121 Waiawa Road—Watercress of Hawaii
96-135 Kamehameha Highway (1937)—Solmirin House

Kalihi-Ala Moana Segment

1441 Kapiolani Boulevard (1959)—Ala Moana Building

Some buildings we would appreciate further photographed for our state historic resource inventory are:

606 Coral (1963)
975 Queen Street (1941)—Tropical Lampshade
1209 Kona Street (1943)—Honolulu Hardwoods

Finally, based on new information emerging regarding resources in the vicinity of former Marine Corps Air Station 'Ewa Field, additional consideration should be given to resources, if any, in the area of potential effect associated with the December 7, 1941 attack. Please further qualify the description of MCAS 'Ewa (p. 4-2), for which a few resources remain extant (p. 4-8). Ongoing consultation with the Navy regarding the transfer of parcels in this area to a private developer has recently revealed the necessity for more thorough investigation as to the status and eligibility of these resources. This includes the MCAS 'Ewa runways (p. 4-10), which should be evaluated in accordance with the National Park Service bulletin, *Guidelines for Identifying, Evaluating, and Registering America's Historic Battlefields*.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment. Should you have any additional questions or concerns, please do not hesitate to contact Dr. Astrid Liverman in our O'ahu office at (808) 692-8015.

Sincerely,


Nancy A. McMahon
Deputy State Historic Preservation Officer

AMBL:

c:

Laura H. Thielen, State Historic Preservation Officer and Chairperson, Department of Land and Natural Resources [email]

U.S. Department of the Interior, National Park Service

Frank Hays, Director, Pacific West Region-Honolulu [email]

Dr. Elaine Jackson-Retondo, Architectural Historian, Pacific West Region [email]

National Trust for Historic Preservation

Brian R. Turner, Law Fellow, Western Office [email]

Elizabeth S. Merritt, Deputy General Counsel, Law Department [email]

Historic Hawaii Foundation, Kiersten Faulkner, Executive Director [email]

Advisory Council on Historic Preservation, Katty Harris, Historic Preservation Specialist,

Office of Federal Agency Programs, 1100 Pennsylvania Avenue N.W., Suite 809,
Washington, D.C. 20004

Office of Hawaiian Affairs Honolulu, 711 Kapi'olani Boulevard, Suite 500, Honolulu, Hawai'i
96813

Dee Ruzicka and Wendy Wichman, Mason Architects Inc. [email]

Lawrence Spurgeon, Supervising Environmental Engineer, Parsons Brinckerhoff [email]

From: Astrid.M.Liverman@hawaii.gov [mailto:Astrid.M.Liverman@hawaii.gov]
Sent: Friday, November 14, 2008 11:18 AM
To: Ann Yoklavich
Cc: Faith Miyamoto (Honolulu DTS) (fmiyamoto@co.honolulu.hi.us); Spurgeon, Lawrence;
Nancy.A.McMahon@hawaii.gov
Subject: Re: FW: E-mail and phone call about additional properties to be re-evaluated

Dear All:

The SHPD concurs with the recommendations below for eligibility assessment forms based on the additional information submitted to our office by Mason Architects Inc. on October 21 and in subsequent telephone conversations. The integrity of the Sandobal House has been compromised by a recent addition. The Solmirin and related residences do not retain sufficient integrity. Watercress of Hawai'i should be examined for its context as a historic landscape to which the structures are non-contributing. A single form can be prepared for the Okahara and Ohara apartment structures.

Thank you for your time and attention. Should you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Best regards,

Astrid M. B. Liverman, Ph.D.
Architecture Branch Chief
State Historic Preservation Division
Department of Land and Natural Resources

Kakuhihewa Building
601 Kamokila Blvd., Suite 555
Kapolei, Hawai'i 96707
Ph: (808) 692-8015
(808) 692-8028 (direct)
Fax: (808) 692-8020

"Ann Yoklavich" <ay@masonarch.com>

11/10/2008 06:23 PM

To <Astrid.M.Liverman@hawaii.gov>
cc "Spurgeon, Lawrence" <Spurgeon@pbworld.com>, "Faith Miyamoto \\\(Honolulu DTS\\) \\\(fmiyamoto@co.honolulu.hi.us\\)" <fmiyamoto@honolulu.gov>
Subject FW: E-mail and phone call about additional properties to be re-evaluated

1/5/2009

Hi Astrid,

Thanks for calling back about this e-mail on November 4. When we met with PB that afternoon, Lawrence said it would be fine for you to answer this e-mail with an e-mail, rather than having to issue another official letter, in addition to the SHPD letter dated October 3, 2008 (LOG no. 2008.3917 / DOC No. 0810AL02). He just asked that when you reply, if you could please cc: him and Faith Miyamoto (e-mail addresses above).

In summary, the parcels for which we will prepare additional eligibility assessment forms will be the following:

| TMK | Address | Name |
|---------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| 94025008 | 94-526 Farrington | Ishihara House |
| 94039082 | 94-143 Pupukahi St | Terahira Apts |
| 94017043 | 94-1031 Kahuamoku St | Carvalho Apts |
| 94019020 & 94019021 | 94-965 & 973 Awane'i St | Ohara & Okahara Apts |
| 96003026 | 96-121 Waiawa Rd | Watercress of Hawaii |
| 23039001 | 1441 Kapiolani Blvd | Ala Moana Bldg |

As I recall our discussion on November 6, you agreed that the Sandobal House (TMK 94038050) and the Solmirin and other houses (TMK 96003018) did not retain sufficient integrity for NR eligibility. The eligibility form for the Watercress of Hawaii parcel will stress the landscape as NR-eligible, rather than the buildings. An eligibility form will be prepared to include the Okahara Apartments, as well as the Ohara Apartments, since they are almost identical. If you prefer, separate forms for these two adjacent parcels could be prepared.

Thank you again for your assistance.

Aloha,
Ann Yoklavich

From: Ann Yoklavich
Sent: Monday, October 20, 2008 1:33 PM
To: 'Astrid.M.Liverman@hawaii.gov'
Cc: 'Spurgeon, Lawrence'; Dee Ruzicka; Wendy Wichman
Subject: Photos of the 8 additional properties to be re-evaluated and questions about some of them

Hi Astrid,

Dee will mail you today a CD of further photographs that we took of the eight properties, listed in the SHPD's October 3, 2008 letter as the additional ones to be considered potentially

eligible. In addition, we have included the requested further photographs, for the State Historic Resource Inventory, of the three parcels in Kaka'ako.

The new photos and other information led us to ask you about the evaluation forms for the following:

Sandobal House (TMK 94038050 at 94-1066 Awaiki Place):

The photo on the form was taken in 2006, as part of the Alternatives Analysis phase of the Transit project. Since then an addition, which is larger than the original house, has been built in the rear. The photos on the CD show that this addition is visible from the street, both along the sides of the house and because a portion of the addition's roof is visible above the original carport roof. Due to the large addition, the building perhaps does not retain sufficient integrity for eligibility?

Parcel with houses owned by the Solmirin, Sismar, and Alipio families (TMK 96003018 at 96-135 etc. Kamehameha Highway):

(We will re-label the name of the property with the original owners' name on tax records – Ida Mahikoa). This is the parcel that includes the Quonset hut house, plus one that is difficult to photograph due to trees and storage structure in the front yard. We are not sure of all the dates, but the house shown on the form we had previously labeled as Solmirin and other houses (occupied by Solmirin or Sismar, we are not sure who occupies it), dates from 1950, not 1937. The 1937 date may have been an error on the database list we started with. The photographs show a total of six houses on the parcel, but the back three are either recent structures or so heavily altered, that the three along the Kamehameha Highway are the relevant ones. Even those three, we found, are more extensively altered than some of our initial inventory photos indicated. For instance, there are three kinds of siding, rebuilt foundation walls of CMU, plus a carport and another covered area supported by CMU posts. We are including an aerial photo of the area (enlarged from the pane map) to help you figure out the shots. Your comments on the integrity of these houses would be helpful.

Watercress of Hawaii (TMK 96003016, various address on Waiawa Road):

We are also including an aerial map with the photo numbers indicated to show where the numerous new photographs were taken. For this parcel, we were leaning towards writing the form about the eligibility of the agricultural landscape, but not the buildings, due to the extensive alterations to all. Would you agree with that approach?

We would appreciate any observations or insights that you could share with us about these parcels. Thanks for your help. I will be gone the last week of October, but please call Dee or Wendy if you have any questions about these additional photos.

Aloha,
Ann

Ann Yoklavich
Architectural Historian
Mason Architects, Inc.
119 Merchant Street, Suite 501
Honolulu, HI 96813
ph. (808) 536-0556
fax (808) 526-0577



U.S. Department
of Transportation
**Federal Transit
Administration**

REGION IX
Arizona, California,
Hawaii, Nevada, Guam
American Samoa,
Northern Mariana Islands

201 Mission Street
Suite 1650
San Francisco, CA 94105-1839
415-744-3133
415-744-2726 (fax)

APR 28 2010

Ms. Laura Thielen, State Historic Preservation Officer
Department of Land and Natural Resources
State Historic Preservation Division
Kakuhikewa Building, Room 555
601 Kamokila Blvd.
Kapolei, Hawaii 96707

Attention: Ms. Nancy McMahon,
Deputy State Historic Preservation Officer

RE: Refinement of Proposed Alignment for the
Honolulu High Capacity Transit Corridor
Project --

Dear Ms. Thielen:

The Federal Transit Administration (FTA), and City and County of Honolulu Department of Transportation Services (DTS) have modified the Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project (the "project") in the vicinity of Honolulu International Airport to avoid encroachment into the center portion of the runway protection zone of Runways 22L/4R and 4L/22R. The alignment will now transition from Aolele Street to Ualena Street between Ohohia Street and Keekahi Lagoon Beach Park.

The FTA has amended the Area of Potential Effects (APE) to reflect this design refinement. The revised APE follows the approach that FTA established with the Hawaii State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO) in December 2007. The revised APE in this area is included as an attachment to this letter.


The FTA has surveyed all built resources constructed prior to 1969 within the revised APE. In addition, architectural historians who meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Professional Qualifications assessed each property for National Register of Historic Places eligibility. The FTA has determined that there are no historic resources eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places within the revised APE. Eligibility forms for each pre-1969 property within the revised APE are attached to this letter.

Because no new eligible resources are present within the revised APE, the project would have no effect on historic properties within this new area, and the refinement of the proposed alignment would not change the adverse effect determination for the overall project.

On July 22, 2009, the SHPO concurred with FTA's adverse effect determination for the proposed project regarding the Hawaii Employers Council Building's (HECB) setting, feel, and association. With the design refinement, the proposed rail alignment would be closer to the National Register eligible HECB. Ground vibration from construction activities does not often reach levels that can damage structures. The new proximity of the rail alignment to the HECB is within a range such that, as a precautionary measure, FTA would require further study on construction-related vibration during final design. This evaluation would be included in the Noise and Vibration Mitigation Plan already specified in Stipulation X of the current Programmatic Agreement. The Noise and Vibration Mitigation plan would contain numeric limits, monitoring measures, and mitigation based on FTA's 2006 *Transit Noise and Vibration Guidance*. This letter requests SHPO concurrence with the FTA's eligibility determinations for the properties within the revised APE.

This determination does not change any of the resources addressed in or commitments made in the Section 106 Programmatic Agreement; therefore, the FTA intends to proceed with the execution of the current Programmatic Agreement.

Sincerely,



Leslie T. Rogers
Regional Administrator

Enclosures:

Maps of APE for Ualena Design Option
Eligibility forms for properties within the revised APE area

cc: Ms. Blythe Semmer, Advisory Council on Historic Preservation
Dr. Pua Aiu, State Historic Preservation Division
Ms. Faith Miyamoto, City and County of Honolulu

LINDA LINGLE
GOVERNOR OF HAWAII



**STATE OF HAWAII
DEPARTMENT OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES**

POST OFFICE BOX 621
HONOLULU, HAWAII 96809

LAURA H. THIELEN
CHAIRPERSON
BOARD OF LAND AND NATURAL RESOURCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT

RUSSELL Y. TSUJI
FIRST DEPUTY

KEN C. KAWAHARA
DEPUTY DIRECTOR - WATER

AQUATIC RESOURCES
BOATING AND OCEAN RECREATION
BUREAU OF CONVEYANCES
COMMISSION ON WATER RESOURCE MANAGEMENT
CONSERVATION AND COASTAL LANDS
CONSERVATION AND RESOURCES ENFORCEMENT
ENGINEERING
FORESTRY AND WILDLIFE
HISTORIC PRESERVATION
KAHOOLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION
LAND
STATE PARKS

May 27, 2010

Leslie T. Rogers, Regional Administrator
U.S. Department of Transportation
Federal Transit Administration
201 Mission Street, Suite 1650
San Francisco, California 94105

LOG NO: 2010.1865
DOC NO: 1005MA10

Architecture

Dear Leslie Rogers:

**SUBJECT: NHPA Section 106 Review
Refinement of Proposed Alignment for the Honolulu High Capacity Transit
Corridor Project
Multiple parcels in TMK plat 1-10-40 and 1-1-16**

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the architectural inventory sheets and maps for the aforementioned proposed project, which we received on April 28, 2010. The FTA has decided to move the transit corridor project from Aolele Street to Ualena Street between Ohohia Street and Keehi Lagoon Beach Park, and has asked SHPD for concurrence on its determination of "no effect to historic properties" along the Ualena Street corridor between Ohohia Street and Keehi Lagoon Beach Park.

We have reviewed the April 28, 2010 materials you submitted to our office (Prepared by PB, as well as such previously submitted materials, as a "Historic Effects Report Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project" report dated April 14, 2009, and a set of inventory forms entitled, "Historic Resources Eligibility Forms Honolulu High-Capacity Transit Corridor Project," dated August 15, 2008. It appears the area covered by the materials included in your office's April 28, 2010 e-mail was not covered in the initial rapid transit historic sites inventory.

The inventory of August 15, 2008, by Mason architects had evaluated buildings along Ualena and Koapaka Streets. Only one building in the former APE was determined eligible for the National Register. This was the Hawaii Employer's Council Building, eligible under Criteria A and C. Although built in 1961, it will attain 50 years before project construction. It has already been determined that the project will have an adverse effect on this property, and therefore, mitigation measures are already addressed in the Programmatic Agreement. SHPD agreed with this determination and with the other "not eligible" determinations for other properties along Ualena and Kaoapaka Streets (LOG 2008.3917, DOC 0810L02). We note that SHPD disagreed with determinations made for other sectors of the project.

The additional significance sheets provided to our office by e-mail on April 28, 2010, and dated November 2009, by PB, evaluated 15 additional historic buildings potentially affected by the revised route. None of the buildings were evaluated as eligible for the National Registers. Therefore FTA determined that the revised project route would have no additional effect to historic properties from

Ms. Rogers
Page 2

Aolele Street to Ualena Street between Ohohia Street and Keehi Lagoon Beach Park. SHPD concurs with this determination.

Should you have any questions regarding architectural concerns, please contact Nancy A. McMahon at (808) 692-8015.

Aloha,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, reading "Nancy A. McMahon".

Nancy A. McMahon (Deputy SHPO)
State Historic Preservation Officer

cc. Ms. Blythe Semmer, Advisory Council on Historic Preservation
Ms. Faith Miyamoto, City and County of Honolulu
Ms. Pua Aiu, Historic Preservation Division